

Title	Gender Pay Gap Report 2019
--------------	-----------------------------------

Status	For approval
History	Combined Equality Standards Data Report July 2019 Gender Pay Gap Report March 2019

Board Lead(s)	Jane Nicholson, Interim Chief People Officer			
Key purpose	Strategy	Assurance	Policy	Performance

Executive Summary

1. The purpose of this report is to:

- Provide analysis on the Gender Pay Gap (GPG) metrics and any disparities noted within them;
- Provide recommendations as to how the Trust can advance gender equality.

2. The Trust's data for the GPG metrics were presented to Board in the Combined Equality Standards Data Report in July 2019. Alongside the metrics, feedback was received from staff across the Trust through surveys, conference events, and one-to-one discussions.

3. The feedback and metrics were analysed to understand the reasons behind disparities and produce recommendations to reduce them. Key findings from this analysis include:

- Access to flexible working and maternity leave are barriers for progression of women within the Trust;
- Despite having a negative impact on the overall bonus pay gap, the winter incentive scheme has had a positive impact for women and closed the proportion of men and women receiving bonus payments.

4. There are also actions already underway to address other disparities noted in the metrics. These actions include:

- A review of the allocation of Clinical Excellence Awards;
- Introduction of a scoring matrix to structure technical interviews;
- Supporting the Women's Network to hold events for days such as International Women's Day.

5. The recommended actions have been summarised in **Appendix 3**. They aim to improve performance on the GPG metrics and improve gender equality.

Recommendation

6. The Board is asked to:

- Note the contents of this report; and
- Review the recommended actions in this report.

Gender Pay Gap Report 2019

1. Purpose

- 1.1. This report has been created in order to demonstrate compliance against the Gender Pay Gap (GPG) Reporting Legislation and advance gender equality within the Trust.
- 1.2. This report follows the Combined Equality Standards Data Report which was presented to Trust Board in July 2019, detailing the GPG metrics.
- 1.3. The purpose of this report is to:
 - 1.3.1. Provide analysis on the GPG metrics and any disparities noted within them;
 - 1.3.2. Provide recommendations as to how the Trust can advance gender equality.

2. Background

- 2.1. As of 6 April 2017, UK employers with more than 250 staff are required by law to publish figures relating to their gender pay gap with public sector organisations required to do so by 31 March, annually.
- 2.2. The report requires organisations to publish the following figures:
 - 2.2.1. Gender Pay Gap (mean and median averages);
 - 2.2.2. Gender Bonus Gap (mean and median averages);
 - 2.2.3. Proportion of men and women receiving bonuses;
 - 2.2.4. Proportion of men and women in each quartile of the organisation's pay structure.
- 2.3. Organisations must publish these figures with a written statement on their public-facing website and report their data to the government through an online service. They are required to do this by 31st March annually.
- 2.4. The Trust published its GPG report with the 2018 data in March 2019. In that report it was decided to bring forward the date the Trust would publish its next GPG report to bring it in line with other related reporting requirements: the Workforce Race Equality Standard (WRES) and the Workforce Disability Equality Standard (WDES). This was also to allow for more timely reporting against the GPG.
- 2.5. A summary of the GPG metrics and the data sources used can be found in **Appendix 1**.

Oxford University Hospitals NHS FT

- 2.6. A summary of the Trust's GPG metrics, as reported in the Combined Equality Standards Data Report 2019, can be found in **Appendix 2**.
- 2.7. In order to enable effective understanding of the metrics and reasons behind disparities, feedback has been collected from staff. This has been through a number of methods including:
- 2.7.1. the Equality at OUH Survey, completed by 52 members of staff;
 - 2.7.2. the Embracing Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Conference;
 - 2.7.3. discussions with members of the staff networks, and with the respect and dignity ambassadors;
 - 2.7.4. feedback gathered through the 'discover' phase of the Culture and Leadership Programme;
 - 2.7.5. feedback gathered through attendees of training, such as the 'recruiting for recruiters training' and 'respect and dignity at work managers toolkit training';
 - 2.7.6. one-to-one discussions with staff on issues relating to equality, diversity and inclusion.
- 2.8. This feedback enables the Trust to understand the perceptions and experiences of staff relating to issues of equality, diversity and inclusion. It will be used to help form the approach the Trust takes as a result.

3. Action Taken

- 3.1. Following the publication of the previous GPG Report in March 2019, a number of actions have been undertaken, or are being undertaken, to advance gender equality and address the issues raised in that report. It should be noted however, that some of the actions were implemented following the snapshot date that has to be used for this data and therefore the impact of these actions on the reported metrics will be limited.

Women's Network

- 3.2. The Women's Network has continued to hold monthly sessions to engage with women across the Trust and provide a safe space for women to discuss issues that impact them in the workplace.
- 3.3. The Network now has a presence on Yammer and the intranet to better promote the work they are doing and increase the support they can provide to women.

International Women's Day Event

- 3.4. An event was held to celebrate International Women's Day on 8th March 2019.

Oxford University Hospitals NHS FT

- 3.5. The event was supported by Unison and consisted of a confidence building workshop, as well as a talk by Shamin Durrani, who talked about her experiences as a female leader in a male-dominated field.
- 3.6. The event was well attended and received positive feedback; it is planned that the Trust does a similar event for the next International Women's Day.

Recruitment Scoring Matrix

- 3.7. Following feedback from the Women's Network, a recruitment scoring matrix has been developed. The matrix aims to help managers' structure interview questions and will ask them to score against pre-determined criteria; making the responses comparable and reducing the impact of unconscious bias. This was identified as an effective action in reducing the pay gaps by the Government Equalities Office.¹
- 3.8. The pilot was delayed from when it was initially due to commence due to capacity issues and changes in personnel however the pilot will commence in autumn 2019.

Reducing Pay Gaps at VSM Level

- 3.9. Following previous GPG reports identifying pay at very senior manager (VSM) level contributing to the Trust's pay gap, work has been undertaken to monitor and standardise pay gaps. As a result the mean pay gap for roles at this level has reduced from 28.9% in March 2018 to 15.8% in March 2019, with a similar reduction in median pay gap from 25% to 12.7% over the same period.
- 3.10. The pay gaps are being considered as part of the recent changes at executive level and it is hoped that these gaps will close even further as a result.

Clinical Excellence Award Study

- 3.11. Previous GPG reports identified that Clinical Excellence Awards (CEAs) were the major contributor to the Trust's bonus pay gap. CEAs are monetary awards given to recognise consultants for work that is above and beyond their day-to-day roles. Men are disproportionately recognised with these resulting in a pay gap.
- 3.12. To better understand the reasons behind this, the Trust has commenced work with the Behavioural Insights Team (BIT), who have been commissioned by the Government Equalities Office, to analyse the Trust's data with regard to CEAs.
- 3.13. The analysis is due to be completed in October 2019 where BIT will discuss with the Trust factors leading to the pay gap in CEAs and will then work with the Trust to develop interventions to reduce the pay gap.

¹ Government Equalities Office (2019). [Reducing the gender pay gap and improving gender equality in organisations: Evidence-based actions for employers.](#)

3.14. In addition following feedback, the Trust in conjunction with the British Medical Association (BMA) will be providing three application training sessions prior to the 2019 CEA round, this training will be actively promoted to the Consultant female workforce.

4. Key Findings

4.1. Analysis has been split into key findings that will discuss some of the issues that have come to light in the analysis of the metrics and the feedback from staff.

4.2. There are some disparities within the metrics that are not discussed below. This is because it would be a repetition of findings from the previous report and there are already actions in place, or planned, that aim to address those disparities. These will be visited in future reports once the outcomes of these actions are known.

Concerns around flexible working hindering progression for women

4.3. Removing barriers to progression for women is the key consideration when it comes to addressing the GPG. Metric 4 shows there has been an increase in the proportion of women within the upper quartiles of the Trust's pay structure, this is positive for the Trust and helps to reduce the ordinary pay gap. However, it is felt by staff that there are still barriers for women with regard to progression within the Trust.

4.4. One of the issues raised by women was access to flexible working. There were many experiences shared where people have seen capable and well-qualified women not go for progression opportunities due to personal circumstances or caring responsibilities and feeling like there would not be the support to work flexibly within those opportunities.

4.5. The Trust has a flexible working procedure and encourages flexible working where possible, however it is felt that the Trust-wide messaging on flexible working and actual application of it differ, with access to flexible working being inconsistent across the Trust.

4.6. The primary reason for this inconsistency of application is due to concerns about workforce supply and the impact it has on the service. Many managers have spoken of concerns about their ability to manage flexible working where they are already struggling to meet service demand. However, through enabling more flexible working, the Trust may also be able to address some issues in terms of workforce supply; for example through filling roles where it is difficult to find people willing to work full-time by those wishing to job-share.

4.7. There have been many examples within the Trust where thinking creatively about roles has enabled more effective service delivery, but also created progression opportunities for staff.

Oxford University Hospitals NHS FT

- 4.8. It is recommended that the Trust promotes these examples and proactively encourages managers to look at flexible working as a potential option in resolving workforce supply issues.
- 4.9. Another approach to explore would be to look at how we promote roles. In a current pilot being run with the Behavioural Insights Team, Zurich International are advertising all applicable jobs as being suitable for part time, job share, or full time. Whilst this is still in pilot, actively promoting flexible working opportunities is an action that is believed to have a promising impact in helping to address the GPG.²
- 4.10. It is recommended that the Trust explores how it can promote flexible working opportunities more prominently when advertising roles.

Maternity leave has an impact on progression for women

- 4.11. Another factor that was raised by women as having a negative impact on progression was taking maternity leave. Some women have said that they have felt like their career has stalled through taking maternity leave and that when coming back they have found it difficult to reintegrate themselves into the workplace. This ‘motherhood penalty’ is a well-documented issue that can contribute towards gender pay gaps, especially as having children disproportionately impacts women in terms of time taken for childcare.³
- 4.12. One way to mitigate this could be to try to redress the gender balance of people taking leave through promotion Shared Parental Leave. By encouraging the sharing of childcare responsibilities the Trust could reduce the time that women are out of the workplace, thereby reducing the impact it has on their careers.
- 4.13. There have been recent changes to the NHS Terms and Conditions to include enhanced pay for Shared Parental Leave for Agenda for Change staff and Junior Doctors on the 2016 contract. This removes a potential financial barrier for people taking up this opportunity. It is recommended that the Trust actively promotes this to staff so that they are aware of the changes and feel confident taking up the opportunity.
- 4.14. Another consideration could be on how to more effectively integrate women back into the workplace. There is currently no training for managers on this so the Trust should also consider developing further support for managers on the topic of parental leave to enable smoother integration.

Introduction of Winter Incentives has had a positive impact for women

² Government Equalities Office (2019). [Reducing the gender pay gap and improving gender equality in organisations: Evidence-based actions for employers](#).

³ International Labour Office (2015). [The motherhood pay gap: A review of the issues, theory and international evidence](#)

- 4.15. From the implementation of the GPG reporting there has been a year-on-year increase in the proportion of all staff receiving bonuses, with this having a significant positive impact for women. Metric 3 shows how from the previous year to this year the proportion of women receiving bonuses has increased by 46.98% and the gap between the proportion of men and women receiving bonuses has closed considerably.
- 4.16. Despite their beneficial nature, the introduction has had the effect of widening the Trust's overall bonus pay gap; although it has closed slightly this year. However, as stated in the last GPG report, the CEAs have a much larger impact on bonus pay gaps due to the larger sums being awarded. The aforementioned study with BIT should work towards addressing this.

5. Conclusion and GPG Action Plan

- 5.1. Analysis of the metrics and feedback from staff has identified a number of areas in which the Trust could take action to improve gender equality. These include:
- 5.1.1. Proactively supporting flexible working;
 - 5.1.2. Promoting shared parental leave;
 - 5.1.3. Providing further support for staff returning from parental leave.
- 5.2. This report has made a number of recommendations in terms of action to address issues raised within the report. These actions are summarised in the GPG Action Plan in **Appendix 3**.
- 5.3. It is requested that these recommended actions are reviewed; approved actions will be added to the Trust's EDI Action Plan.
- 5.4. Whilst these recommendations do not address all of the disparities noted within the metrics, there are actions that are already planned, or are underway, that will address issues that have been raised previously. These actions are detailed in Section 3: Action Taken.
- 5.5. There are also other actions that have been recommended as part of the WRES and WDES reports that will likely have a positive impact on the GPG. These include:
- 5.5.1. The continuation of inclusive recruitment training;
 - 5.5.2. Changes to shortlisting to increase objectivity and mitigate potential bias;
 - 5.5.3. Consideration of diversity as part of talent management and succession planning;
 - 5.5.4. Introducing Board-level Champions for each staff network;

5.6. More information on these actions can be found in the WRES and WDES 2019 reports.

6. Recommendation

6.1. The Board is ask to:

6.1.1. Note the contents of this report;

6.1.2. Review the recommended actions in this report; and

6.1.3. Consider due dates and success measures for the recommended actions.

Jane Nicholson
Interim Chief People Officer

Paper prepared by:

Tommy Snipe
Equality, Diversity, and Inclusion Manager

August 2019

Appendix 1 – GPG Metrics Summary

Under the Gender Pay Gap Reporting Legislation, organisations are required to publish the following figures:

- Gender Pay Gap (mean and median averages);
- Gender Bonus Gap (mean and median averages);
- Proportion of men and women receiving bonuses;
- Proportion of men and women in each quartile of the organisation's pay structure.

These figures have been compiled using a report created by IBM that utilises data kept on ESR.

Bonus pay includes:

- Clinical Excellence Awards;
- Discretionary Points for non-training grade doctors e.g. staff grades and associate specialists;
- Payments made under Trust incentive schemes (including the Winter Incentive Scheme);
- Bonus payments;
- Distinction awards.

Pay gaps are reported as the relative percentage difference between men's and women's earnings. A positive percentage difference indicates men are paid higher and a negative percentage difference indicates women are paid higher. All percentages are given to 1 decimal place, as required upon submission to the Government Equalities Office.

Appendix 2 – OUH WDES Metrics 2019

Metric 1. Mean and median gender pay gap for ordinary pay.

	Mean Hourly Rate			Median Hourly Rate		
	2018	2019	Difference	2018	2019	Difference
Men	£22.90	£23.55	£0.65	£17.38	£17.60	£0.22
Women	£16.80	£17.24	£0.44	£14.74	£15.28	£0.54
Difference	£6.10	£6.31	£0.21	£2.64	£2.32	-£0.32
Pay Gap %	26.60%	26.78%	0.17%	15.20%	13.16%	-2.04%

Metric 2. Mean and median gender pay gap for bonus pay

	Mean Bonus Pay			Median Bonus Pay		
	2018	2019	Difference	2018	2019	Difference
Men	£9,471.77	£8,455.35	-£1,016.42	£3,013.47	£3,015.96	£2.49
Women	£2,218.50	£2,112.73	-£105.77	£350.00	£660.00	£310.00
Difference	£7,253.27	£6,342.62	-£910.65	£2,663.47	£2,355.96	-£307.51
Pay Gap %	76.60%	75.01%	-1.59%	88.40%	78.12%	-10.28%

Metric 3. Proportion of men and women receiving bonuses

	2018	2019	Percentage Increase
Men	11.20%	12.26%	9.46%
Women	6.30%	9.26%	46.98%

Metric 4: Proportion of men and women in each quartile of the Trust's pay structure (Q1=low, Q4=high). Headcounts given in italics.

Quartile	2018		2019		Difference in proportion of women
	Women	Men	Women	Men	
1	79.10% <i>2247</i>	20.90% <i>595</i>	78.76% <i>2324</i>	21.33% <i>630</i>	-0.34% 77
2	79.60% <i>2370</i>	20.40% <i>606</i>	79.75% <i>2355</i>	20.25% <i>598</i>	0.15% -15
3	79.90% <i>2310</i>	20.10% <i>581</i>	80.91% <i>2391</i>	19.09% <i>564</i>	1.01% 81
4	61.10% <i>1788</i>	38.90% <i>1139</i>	61.68% <i>1822</i>	38.32% <i>1132</i>	0.58% 34

Appendix 3 – Recommended GPG Actions

The below table summarises recommended action to advance Gender Equality within the Trust. If approved by the Trust Board these will then be incorporated into the Trust’s Equality, Diversity and Inclusion Action Plan

Action	Lead	Due	Success Measure
Curate and promote case studies of successful uses of flexible working within the Trust	EDI Manager	March 2020	Measure uptake of flexible working opportunities.
Explore possibilities to promote flexible working at job advert	Head of Resourcing	August 2020	Measure uptake of flexible working opportunities.
Promote shared parental leave	Interim Chief People Officer	October 2019 and ongoing	Measure uptake of shared parental leave as opposed to maternity.
Explore support that could be provided to staff returning from parental leave	EDI Manager	August 2020	Measure staff feedback of those returning from Parental Leave. Measure changes in retention following return.